wenngleich er sich überwiegend eben mit der Neuzeit beschäftigt. Ein Register der Tiere und Fabelwesen schließt diesen begrüßenswerten Sammelband ab.

Albrecht Classen


One might assume that proverbs are simply the stuff of the folklore, and exempla confined to preaching manuals intended for instructing the folk. This well-formulated collection of essays, however, proves otherwise, positing an important coexistence and intersection of proverbs and exempla. Indeed, Hugo Bizzarri's introduction lays the ground for understanding the general theme of the colloquium and, by extension, of the collection: the points of contact between the proverb and the exemplum. Moreover, the fourteen essays here exhibit a surprising range of approaches, fields, languages, and time periods.

Several essays center on the (changing) definition of proverb/exemplum. For example, Klaus Grubmüller's essay calls for a broadening of the definition of the exemplum, suggesting both that exempla can be comic and, conversely, that short tales and fabliaux can have a didactic and moralizing function. Grubmüller's essay neatly follows in the vein of Hugo Bizzarri's introductory essay, which outlines the difficulty of defining the proverb and the exemplum, alluding to the overlap in definition between the two in such works as the dialogue of Soloman and Marcolf and Juan Manuel's Conde Lucanor. For Bizzarri, there is a back-and-forth movement between the two terms, particularly in dialogue, exemplary biographies, and fables, rather than in sermons, where they remain distinctly defined entities. Carlos Alvar's essay on Galician/Portuguese chansons carefully demonstrates the difficulty of generic definition, since although refrán (‘traditional saying,’ itself derived from fabla, fabiella, and sometimes simply called verbo antiguo, or verso, or viessa) was traditionally distinguished from proverbio by its popular origins, refrán acquires the notion of proverb or proverbial saying in the fifteenth century. From this point de départ, Alvar cogently examines the re-use of such ‘traditional sayings’ in court poetry, and finds that proverbs and proverbial sayings fill the chansons, especially satirical song, of Galician and Portuguese poets.

A few essays look to the artes prae dicandi and the use of proverbs and exempla by preachers in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. Marie Anne Polo de Beaulieu and Jacques Berlioz argue that proverbs inserted in collections of exempla function as a means of creating 'cultural' connections and collusion between preachers and the laity. Their study focuses on texts in which proverbs were used freely: first, in four thirteenth-century collections, including the works of the Dominicans Etienne de Bourbon and Humbert de Romans, the Franciscan
Tabula exemplorum, and the Dominican
Compilacio singularis exemplorum; sec-
ond, in two fourteenth-century texts,
Jean Bromyard’s Summa praedicantium
and the Old French Ci nous dit; and fi-
nally, in exemplary literature, particu-
larly that of Jacques de Vitry. They quite
perceptively see Latin collections at-
testing to the oral use of proverbs: while
written in Latin, they were meant to be
spoken in the vernacular, as the expres-
sion ‘vulgariter dicitur’ reveals. They
find that while Cistercians and Francis-
cans rarely used proverbs, Dominicans
typically made use of proverbs slightly
more often, and moreover, that proverbs
appear more frequently in vernacular
collections of exempla. They conclude
therefore that preachers did have collec-
tions of proverbs at their disposal, some
of which were written for use in preach-
ing. These scholars also provide a
useful appendix of eight proverbs that
appear in the Compilacio singularis ex-
emplorum. Franco Morenzoni, on the
other hand, pinpoints mid-thirteenth
century Parisian preachers whose ser-
mons most frequently use proverbs. Mo-
renzoni notes that the Artes praedicandi
and the Distinctiones often employ
proverbs both as a means to introduce a
prayer or a sermon and as a means to di-
vide the thematic material; and moreo-
ver, such preachers as Nicolas de Biard
or Guillaume d’Auvergne made use of
proverbs as explanatory or exemplary
material in their collections of sermons.
Audrey Sulpice analyzes the function of
proverbs in the fourteenth-century Tom-
bel de Châtrrose, a collection of thirty-
one tales of salvation intended for use in
predication not only to Carthusians, but
also to the laity. Sulpice persuasively
demonstrates how in this collection, the
proverb (or proverbial expression) ser-
ves both as a means of corroborating
the veracity of the exempla in which it is
inserted, or moreover, of generating the
exempla that it introduces. Sulpice thus
sees a ‘relation de complémentarité’ be-
tween exemplum and proverb, but one in
which the proverb, deriving from a
popular, literary language, confirms and
guarantees the authorial — clerical —
voice. Sulpice’s essay is particularly
rich: its attention to codicology and lit-
erary analysis extends to important
questions of praxis, i.e., how the manu-
scripts were used.

Delphine Carron’s essay turns the
reader to larger questions of philosophy,
here described as the study of how to
live well. Her careful examination of
Cato the Younger, the Roman statesman
and philosopher, as he appears in Latin
medieval proverbs, exempla, and mor-
alizing couplets (distiches), unveils how
he became in the Middle Ages an exam-
ple of the life of wisdom. With a thor-
ough examination of exemplary allu-
sions to his life, and the widespread use
of three formulaic proverbial expres-
sions (“nomina vana Catones,” “Intus
Nero, fori Cato,” “E tertius Cato cello
cecidit”), she cogently describes how for
medieval theologians and writers (in-
cluding Jerome, Peter the Cantor, and
John of Salisbury), Cato provided a
model of austerity, humility, self-
sacrifice, and devotion to civic duty. Her
brief analysis of the Disticha Catonis re-
veals that Cato the Younger and Cato
the Censor were in the Middle Ages fre-
quently conflated, so that “Cato” here
has become simply a descriptor, even synonym, for a wise man.

Philippe Ménard's analysis of a collection of proverbs contained in Cambridge Corpus Christi MS 450 extends Carron's preoccupation with the medie-
val reception of this classical figure of philosophy to our own era. Ménard's arg-
ument turns on the problem of how to understand mentalités médiévales, which have for many years been understood based on the extant writings of a noble and clerical class or on the study of a collective unconscious. He enumerates several difficulties inherent to his study: first, that many proverbs are based on simple observation, and have no deeper signification; that the meaning of some proverbs is obscure; and finally, that this particular collection contains many – some 465 – proverbial expressions. His analysis nevertheless draws some valuable conclusions about the medieval mindset based on this collection: that the proverbs' disdain of peasants and women, and criticism of nobility in Corpus Christi MS 450 may indicate a clerical point of view; that descriptions of hunger and poverty indicate a knowledge of the poor, perhaps drawn from this very milieu. For Ménard, this collection, while representing an intersection of several mentalités (clerical and peasant), chiefly presents a cynical, pes-
simistic, and closed, vision of the world and of human beings, one that seems de-
cidedly non-clerical.

Several essays treat proverbs in liter-
ary contexts, and it is here that we find the widest geographical/linguistic focus of the collection. This is most in evi-
dence with Regula Forster's analysis of proverbs and exempla in the Arabic work Kalila wa-Dimna. Forster notes that in this text both proverbs and exempla fulfill a rhetorical, even argumentative function. Forster's essay is critical, for it reminds the Eurocentric reader that proverbs and exempla are a part of the cultural exchange between East and West (or more precisely, evidence of the influence of the East on the West): after all, the Arabic Kalila wa-Dimna was adapted into Latin, Spanish, Greek, and Hebrew in the thirteenth century, and German in the fifteenth. Looking toward the Continent, Elisabeth Schulze-
Busacker's examination of the Proverbs au villain (ca. 1175) provides a literary and historical contextualization of this work, particularly in terms of the three Anglo-Norman rhyming translations of the Disticha Catonis and the Fables of Marie de France. Moreover, Schulze-
Busacker cogently suggests that the Proverbs au villain adds not only a rhymed but also a strophic quality to these collections of proverbs, and thus grants to the Proverbes an important rhetorical role in the development of medieval French literature. Alfonso D'Agostino, on the other hand, surveys a goldmine of examples of proverbial liter-
ature in thirteenth-century Italy. D'Agostino enumerates how proverbs occur not only in such prose works as Fiori e vita di filosafi e d'altresavi e d'imperadori, the ars dictandi, especially of Guittone d'Arezzo, and vernacular translations of the Disticha Catonis), but also in poetical texts, both didactic (e.g., Garzo dall'Incisa's Proverbi, Proverbia super natura feminarum, Girardo Patec-
chio da Cremona's Splanamento di li
Proverbia de Salamone) and lyrical (e.g., lyrics by Percivalle Doria, Bonagiunta Orbiciani, Giacomo da Lentini, Guido delle Colonne, and Chiaro Davanzati, among others). D’Agostino’s essay neatly illustrates the widespread use of proverbs, or in other words, their application in broad generic contexts.

Three essays focus on Spanish literature. Bernard Darbord studies the paraphrastic function of the proverb in the fourteenth-century Libro de los gatos (a translation of the English cleric Eades de Cheriton’s thirteenth-century Fabulae) and the Libro de Buen amor. For the first, he demonstrates how the exempla included therein frequently conclude with a lapidary statement, a proverb or a saying. To describe the role played by proverbs in the Libro de los Gatos, he provides a taxonomy of characteristics of the proverb, including its opacity, stability, bipartite structure, generalizability, and linguistic and syntactic specificity (i.e., inversion, phonic repetition), and then categorizes the types of proverbs that appear in the Fabulae according to the behavior of the protagonist. For the second, Darbord notes that Juan Ruiz’s use of fabla, fazaña, and proverbio unveil the extent to which his poetic practice of is founded upon paraphrase. Ultimately, he finds that the proverb, like the exemplum which it can even replace, is designed to illustrate, and thus to paraphrase, a salvific lesson. Carlos Heusch’s study of the exemplum in books 1 and 2 of Jean Manuel’s El Conde Lucanor nicely complements Darbord’s essay. Heusch demonstrates that Manuel’s interest in style (whether it is clear and rhetorically amplified or obscure and rhetorically abbreviated), not only upsets the dictates of classical rhetoric and the framework of stylistic definitions upon which he himself has set out, but is, moreover, matched by a movement from didactic clarity (the exemplum of Book 1, drawn from the sermo humilis) to obscurity (the proverb of Book 2, drawn form an Eastern tradition), despite the fact that Manuel calls both exemplum and proverb by the same name, ‘exemplo.’ This movement from the clarity of the exemplum to the obscure and difficult wisdom of the proverb is, as Heusch persuasively argues, a means to structure the book as a ‘chemin de sagesse’ for the reader. Hugo Bizzarri’s concluding essay on proverbs in Castilian incunables and early printed books (1471-1520) concludes the collection. Here Bizzarri examines the Libro de Apolonio and the Castilian translation of AESOP’s Fables, Cato and the recreations of the Disticha Catonis, and Castilian collections of proverbs, among others, in order to unveil how the incunables and early printed books, while relying upon traditional expressions of the proverb contained in manuscripts sometimes to the point of archaism, nevertheless frequently invented new versions for a newly literate mercantile class. He remarks that collections of proverbs and exempla, based on their commercial successes, were not peripheral but rather primary texts in the era of printing. Bizzarri’s essay is fascinating in how it explains the innovations in the genre of proverbs wrought by incunables and early printed books: for example, he notes that this was in part due to the intervention of printers, who were fre-
quenty German, and who, while introducing Erasmus to Spain, brought the influence of his *Adagia* to Castilian proverbs.

The collection does not suffer from a weakness common to many collections: that of organization. While the editors could have made the thematic resonances more apparent by grouping the essays under particular rubrics (say, proverbs and exempla in predication manuals, or in literature), they have placed essays with similar themes in proximity, which allows the reader to make intertextual (whether geographical, generic, or thematic) connections between them. This is especially true in the case of the two essays (those of Darbord and Heusch) dedicated to proverbs in Spanish literature. But how much more breadth of understanding could the reader have gained by having Alvar’s essay on proverbs in Galician and Portuguese songs and Bizzarri’s essay on proverbs in Castilian incunabula and early printed books as bookends to these two essays?. Ultimately, the small problems of organization detract little from what is a collection of provocative and well-crafted essays on a subject that deserves more scholarly attention.

*Michelle Bolduc* · *Department of French, Italian, and Comparative Literature* · *Curtin Hall · P.O. Box 413 · University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee · Milwaukee, WI 53201 · mbolduc@uwm.edu

**Albrecht Classen** (ed.), *Urban Space in the Middle Ages and the Early Modern Age, Walter de Gruyter,* **Berlin and New York: 2009, viii, 757 pp. 70 illustrations.**

This collection consists of an editorial introduction and twenty-three articles originally presented at the Fifth International Symposium on Medieval and Early Modern Studies at the University of Arizona in 2008. Twelve are by scholars of literature, eight by historians, and one each from art, geography, and religion. Nineteen concern mainly the fourteenth through sixteenth centuries; two are earlier and two later. They are individually footnoted without bibliographies. Quotations in languages other than English are translated.

The first 108 pages of Classen’s introduction is a summary of "historical, mental, cultural, and social-economic investigations" of "urban space in the Middle Ages and the Early Modern Age" (p. 1) that can be read with profit even without reference to the other papers, which he then links by individual synopses to the main themes. C. David Benson reconstructs medieval English authors’ discussions of the urban space of Rome, finding that most were concerned mainly with Rome’s past and remains of the martyrs, although some were interested in ancient monuments. Continuing the theme of "Defining the Medieval City through Death," Kisha G. Tracy discusses the relocation of tombs and cemeteries outside town walls in the late Middle Ages and the importance of saints’ relics and tombs in the founding myths of major cities. The presence of the dead was a force attracting living migrants to relocate to urban space. The theme of death is also present in Alan V. Murray’s paper on the two ethnic

V. L.